BOOK REVIEWS

Melissa L. Archer. *'I Was in the Spirit on the Lord's Day:' A Pentecostal Engagement with Worship in the Apocalypse* (Cleveland, TN: CPT, 2015). ix + 361 pp. $19.95 paper.

Within the current Christian context, discussions regarding the book of Revelation often focus solely on eschatology. This practice does not hold true for Melissa Archer as she takes readers on the journey of reading the Apocalypse through a different set of lenses. She guides the reader in recovering a lost art of reading Revelation as it was ready by early North American Pentecostals. Combining biblical studies with a historical theology rooted in a Pentecostal hermeneutic Archer provides a foundation for reading the Apocalypse as a liturgical guide. Through her extensive research and writing, she joins Ron Herms, Philip Mayo, and Robby Waddell as a Pentecostal scholar producing a monograph focused on the book of Revelation. Her first monograph provides a unique contribution the guild of biblical studies. Her work emphasizes the significance of worship for John the Seer and his audience, reveals the impact of John's Apocalypse on an early Pentecostal understanding of worship, and discusses the practical application of Pentecostals the embracing of such a reading of the text today.

While virtually unheard of in present-day Pentecostal publications, Archer uncovers a religious and historical phenomenon within the writings of the Wesleyan-Holiness and Finished Work traditions within the Pentecostal Movement of the early twentieth century. These publications possess multiple intertextual connections with the Apocalypse. These textual relations should serve as no surprise since the belief in the imminence of Christ's return served as an impetus for the formation and growth of the early Pentecostalism in Canada and the United States. Archer explains that the intriguing factor in the discussion of Revelation comes from the association of Revelation's text with testimonies regarding worship experiences. Archer uses this series of occurrences within the early Pentecostal literature as a launching pad into the Apocalypse to uncover that which these individuals saw.

As Archer moves to the second phase of her research, she mines the Apocalypse for the "Liturgical Narratives" embraced by early Pentecostals. Dividing the body of the text according to the εν πνευματι (in the Spirit) discourse marker repeated throughout the book, she presents her analysis in six different phases: the prologue, the four sections of the body, and the epilogue. Each portion of her study reveals the liturgical elements contained in the Apocalypse. In the prologue, the presence of a doxology reveals worship as a means of opening the heart to receive prophetic words. Since John finds himself "in the Spirit on the Lord's day" and he sends his prophecy to the worshiping community, the writing reveals how worship functions as a means of opening the heart to the experience of spiritual manifestations. John uses the second vision to present the worship of God and the Lamb and contrasts this worship with that of Satan and the beast. John then uses his third vision to present the final worship scene of the Apocalypse, which celebrates God judging Babylon and foreshadows the final vision of the text—the marriage of the Lamb. John presents the climax of his visionary experiences in the framework of worship, noting faithful humanity in the presence of God and the Lamb. This scene reinforces the understanding that people commonly encounter God's presence through worship. Archer points out that the end of the Apocalypse brings the original audiences of the Apocalypse back to the worship setting in which they began.

Like the Seer, Archer does not leave her readers in the visionary experience of the Apocalypse, or even in the text of Revelation. She applies the text in a way that urges present-day Pentecostals to recover that which their forebears had—a theology of worship supported by New Testament worship as seen in the Apocalypse. Admittedly, there remains no conclusive evidence regarding the awareness with which early Pentecostals used the text of Revelation in their discussion of worship. Despite this, Archer places before her readers a challenge to read consciously and develop a Pentecostal theology of worship from the book of Revelation.

Archer's work provides a healthy, biblical approach to a text that has served as one associated with confusion and even fear for Pentecostals. Instead of focusing attention on the book's symbolism,

Archer provides a practical answer to the difficult question of how the book of Revelation applies to people's lives today. For those currently within the Pentecostal and Charismatic traditions, Archer provides an understanding of what it means to worship "in the Spirit" and recovers a lost reading of the Apocalypse that seems to have been prevalent just over a century ago.

While many people only turn to the Apocalypse when examining eschatology, Archer's work has the potential to impact the theology of Pentecostals, Charismatics, and the broader Christian community. This impact challenges the Church to recognize and embrace the liturgy of the Apocalypse and apply it as a model of Christian worship, not just for the future but, for the present.

Reviewed by Daniel I. Morrison
Ph.D. Candidate
McMaster Divinity College, Hamilton, ON

Espinosa, Gastón. *Latino Pentecostals in America: Faith and Politics in Action*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2014. xi + 505 pp. $35.00 Hardcover; $22.95 Paperback; $28.48 Kindle.

Gastón Espinosa writes the most extensive study on the development of Latina/o Pentecostalism in the Assemblies of God (AG) in the U.S.A. A shorter introduction was published a couple of years before by Eldín Villafañe.[1] Although the title is misleading because the book does not deal with all of the expressions of Latina/o Pentecostalism in the US.A. or in Latin America, no doubt its subject matter and content sets it apart from other accounts, even from among mainstream Anglo AG versions. The book is much more than a historical retrieval. Espinosa offers a corrective to pervasive misperceptions and conventional stereotypes about Latina/o AG. He demonstrates with convincing evidence that over the last one hundred years Latina/o Pentecostals have "struggled to exercise voice, agency, and leadership in the Assemblies of God, in Latino Protestantism, and in American public life" (13).

Espinosa traces the birth of AG Latina/o Pentecostalism back to the pioneering works of Charles Parham and William Seymour. Refreshingly, he notes other currents of Pentecostalism among African American Pentecostals such as Charles Mason, who ordained Mexican ministers to the Pentecostal movement in Texas. Like Arlene Sánchez Walsh,[2] Espinosa registers the presence and participation of Latinas/os as early as 1906, the first year of the revival at Azusa, and how these families began preaching the Pentecostal message in continental U.S.A., Mexico, Puerto Rico, and other countries.

According to Espinosa, Latinas/os transformed the AG Pentecostal movement from largely monolingual and bicultural to multicultural and bilingual. His crucial documentation corrects pervasive opinions that Latina/o Pentecostalism had its origins in the missionary work of Anglo-U.S.A. missionaries. Instead, he claims, it was Latinas/os who first reached out to the Latina/o communities. It was not H.C. Ball who

1. Eldin Villafañe, *Introducción al Pentecostalismo: Manda fuego Señor* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2012).

2. Arlene M. Sánchez-Walsh, *Latino Pentecostal Identity: Evangelical Faith, Self, and Society* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2003).

founded the AG among Latinas/os in Texas. Instead, the Latina/o AG was born out of the evangelistic work of William Seymour and other Anglo missionaries who converted Mexicans in 1906-1918. These Mexicans with other Anglo missionaries were the first to pioneer the work in Texas by planting a good number of churches all independent of Ball's influence.

Espinosa insists that Ball should be credited as the "single most important founder" of the Latina/o AG, for the leadership he provided the movement for over twenty years. He also makes it clear that it was the independent churches and AG Mexican ministers who injected new energy to the movement by the time Ball assumed its leadership. Thus, Ball's critical role was due in part to the fact that he drove away the most talented Latino leaders and left their contributions out of the early histories of the movement.

Espinosa provides the excellent example of Francisco Olazábal who was forced to resign from the AG.[3] He counters ideas that Latinas/os have been passive recipients in the AG. Rather, he shows that Latinas/os displayed a great deal of independence and creativity; at the time, a growing number of independent Mexican ministers who had joined the AG pushed for the creation of a Mexican District on par with Anglo districts to be led by and for Latinos. Their attempt at reform was quickly stifled because of paternalism, racism and political maneuvering on the side of the Anglo leadership of the AG. Thus, Espinosa concludes that Ball's inability to work alongside with Mexican leaders provoked that some of the churches created their own denomination, the *Consejo Latino Americano de Iglesias Christianas* (CLADIC) under the leadership of Olazábal; the first completely indigenous Latina/o-led Protestant denomination legally incorporated in the United States.

Espinosa also challenges notions that U.S.A. Latina/o and Latin American Pentecostal Movements were the product of Anglo

3. Espinosa's account of Olazábal complement previously published material on the subject. See Gastón Espinosa, "*El Azteca*: Francisco Olázabal and Latino Pentecostal Charisma, Power, and Faith Healing in the Borderlands," *JAAR* 67, no. 3 (Summer 1999): 597–616.

missionaries. He overstates the role of Latinas/os in spreading Pentecostalism in Latin America; his main focus is Puerto Rico and Northern Mexico. Yet, he does a great job at discussing the pioneering work of Juan Lugo in Puerto Rico, the emergence of the Puerto Rican Pentecostal Church of God, and its relation to the AG.

Appropriately, Espinosa also deals with the presence and contributions of women in the Latina/o AG.[4] He is correct in noting that Latina Pentecostals have always been ordained and their numbers have steadily increased throughout the twentieth century. Yet many confront enormous obstacles with patriarchy and cultural expectations of domesticity even today. Again, although it is not uncommon to find women serving in high positions of leadership, they still confront institutional glass ceilings, and no woman has ever been elected general superintendent.

Finally, Espinosa writes a defense against misperceptions of Latina/o Pentecostalism's otherworldly orientation and lack of commitment for social justice work. He notes that although Latina/o AG do not often speak in those terms and do not follow rhetoric comparable to the social gospel or Liberation theology, they nevertheless have an agenda of social engagement and relief that is often incorporated as part and parcel of the work of evangelism and Christian life. In the same way, he explains, Latina/o AG Pentecostals have not remained aloof from engagement in national politics as can be seen in their involvement in the movements led by Reies López de Tijerina, César Chávez, and the work of Jesse Miranda and Samuel Rodríguez at the National Hispanic Christian Leadership Conference (NHCLC).

Overall, this book provides a wealth of information and bibliographical resources for the study of Latina/o Pentecostalism.

4. Some of this material was previously published. See Gastón Espinosa, "'Third Class Soldiers': A History of Hispanic Pentecostal Clergywomen in the Assemblies of God," in *Phillip's Daughters: Women in Pentecostal-Charismatic Leadership*, ed. Estrelda Alexander and Amos Yong (Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications, 2009), 95–111.

Latina/o Pentecostals and Pentecostals from all denominations will benefit greatly from the enormous amount of resources here included.

Reviewed by Néstor Medina
Adjunct Professor of Theology
Emmanuel College, University of Toronto

Coleman, Simon and Rosalind I. J. Hackett (eds.), *The Anthropology of Global Pentecostalism and Evangelicalism* (New York: New York University Press, 2015), vii + 264 pp, $27 paperback.

Within the social sciences, anthropology has been at the forefront of studying Evangelical, Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity, contributing significantly to liberating the study of these movements from the theological niches they had been confined in. By now the Anthropology of Christianity is becoming an established sub-field, and the editors locate their collection precisely at this threshold: taking stock of what has been achieved thus far while exploring new areas of research.

Given the fragmentary nature of a collective volume, the former aim is difficult to achieve. Though many of the case studies refer to established theories in the Anthropology of Christianity, the reader should not expect this book to serve as an introduction to this sub-discipline. The introduction does not aim for a systematic overview of the Anthropology of Christianity (save for a brief sketch of its history and some fairly standard definition of terms), there is little dialogue between chapters themselves, and the afterword by Joel Robbins dwells mostly on the innovative aspects of the book.

This last aspect of innovation and new research questions is where the actual potential of the book lies. Already the introduction makes a number of keen observations about overcoming clear-cut boundaries in studying Christian movements, such as believer vs. non-believer, modernity vs. tradition, or religious vs. secular, calling scholars to emphasize the "more complex and ambiguous forms of accommodation and negotiation between moral, epistemological, and/or cultural alternatives" rather than the all too often invoked notion of "rupture." This is justified and necessary, as well as the editors call to overcome simple explanations of why "really" people commit to Pentecostal or Evangelical forms of Christianity.

The remaining twelve chapters are divided into four sections, which mirror established focal points in the Anthropology of Christianity: morality ("Moralizing the World"), embodiment ("Language and Embodiment"), "materiality" ("Transmission and Mediation"), and politics ("The State and Beyond: New Relations,

New Tensions"). All chapters are based on original fieldwork and their topical and geographical scope is considerable, including not just the usual subjects and regions, but also themes like the making of "miracle truth," or Pentecostal politicians advocating for the decriminalization of drugs, as well as rarely explored countries such as Kyrgyzstan, Polynesia, or Angola. Three of the twelve chapters focus primarily or exclusively on Evangelical churches while the others deal mainly with Pentecostal or Charismatic communities.

Rather than going through the chapters individually, I will limit myself to highlighting a few themes emerging from the book which seem especially important for the study of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements. A first theme arises from the healthy scepticism that some contributors display toward the established notion that Evangelical and Pentecostal/Charismatic Christianity are ultimately about individuality or subjectivity. Omri Elisha shows in the context of a US-American evangelical men's fellowship how intersubjectivity is the realm where subjects and fellowships are constituted alike, and Kelly H. Chong's study of Methodist and Presbyterian women's fellowships in Korea displays the same dynamic of confessional practices simultaneously producing subjectivities and group settings. Kristine Krause's chapter on Ghanaian Pentecostal migrant churches extends the communal aspect of Pentecostal subjectivity beyond the church by showing how Pentecostals moralize the world, and Yannick Fer sketches a whole network of options for Polynesian Pentecostals in "fostering personal itineraries." All of these studies demonstrate that the articulation of Pentecostal and Evangelical subjectivities are co-dependent with communal settings, calling researchers to move beyond dichotomies of individualism/subject versus community/tradition/society, scrutinizing instead the micropolitics of belonging.

A second theme has to do with the demarcation of the divine. Jon Bialecki's observations of language and rhetoric at a Pentecostal academic gathering center on the transitions between academic and Pentecostal forms of speech and embodiment, introducing the concept of affect as a central category. Mathijs Pelkmans analyzes how the truth of a Pentecostal miracle is produced and can decay, while Martijn Oosterbaan studies the volatile boundaries between worship and idolatry in perceptions of popular gospel music in Brazil. What these case studies have in common is that they highlight how the

reality of divine presence is produced and upheld, and the fluidity this entails. Especially in the study of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements this should be explored further, instead of the often applied phenomenological descriptions of Pentecostal experience.

A third and final theme to emerge from multiple contributors points to the dynamics of conformity and subversion. Martin Lindhardt studies how Tanzanian Pentecostals absorb the materiality and mundane value of money by imbuing it with spiritual effect. Thomas Csordas illustrates how the global spread of Catholic Charismatic movements not only follows the patterns and modes of globalization, but is also a way of "reenchanting the world." Ruy Llera Blanes studies the multifarious trajectories of Pentecostal and Evangelical churches when navigating the confines of the Angolan state, while Kevin Lewis O'Neill asserts that Guatemalan Pentecostals use prayer as a medium of politics. These studies demonstrate how Pentecostals adopt and appropriate values, cultures, politics, and space – in a lively dynamic between compliance and subversion, which deserves to be studied in detail instead applying the label "paradox" as is often done.

I hope that these observations show that while the book addresses itself primarily to students of anthropology, the wider research community on Pentecostal movements should also benefit from its insights. Most of the case studies and fieldwork are well argued, with the only caveat being that not all chapters resist the temptation to arrive at very large conclusions about Pentecostalism from the study of one or two specific settings. This is where those more familiar with the diversities and contradictions of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements might offer some constructive criticism and enhance an already fruitful dialogue between religious studies and the social sciences in the study of these movements worldwide.

Reviewed by Dr Jörg Haustein
Senior Lecturer in Religions in Africa

SOAS University of London, UK

Bradley Truman Noel. *Pentecostalism, Secularism, and Post Christendom* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 2015). xvi + 276 pp. $68.08 hardback; $41.79 paper.

Bradley Truman Noel has aimed to provide a primer for pastors and Christian leaders (primarily within the Pentecostal fold) to better understand the existing culture in which the Canadian church finds itself, and to offer constructive (not merely critical) discussion on pertinent issues needing attention if the church hopes to continue to thrive in the midst of current realities. In my view, in *Pentecostalism, Secularism, and Post Christendom*, Noel has successfully hit his target.

The book divides into three parts. The first two present a clear and understandable presentation of classical Pentecostalism in the West, and the present state of western culture, which Noel argues is a post-Christendom environment, marked by secularism and postmodernism. This is followed by a case-study depiction of one Canadian Pentecostal denomination, the Pentecostal Assemblies of Newfoundland and Labrador (PAONL), as it attempts to wrestle with present cultural challenges in the midst of denominational decline. Part three of Noel's project moves from description into what I would consider a mild-mannered (for Pentecostals!) but overt prescriptive mode, in which he raises eight themes that pastors and leaders need to give attention. The themes covered include: 1) raising awareness of the diverse generations presently within the Pentecostal church (six are identified); 2) taking creative risks in a changing culture (the story of Aimee Semple McPherson is used as a model here); 3) understanding biblical missionality; 4) how (and how not) to be an influence in culture; 5) celebrating the Pentecostal penchant for supernaturalism in a postmodern context; 6) welcoming the fact that Canada has moved into a post-Christendom era; 7) learning to appreciate the essence of Pentecostal spirituality over distinctiveness from other traditions, and finally; 8) esteeming values rather than simply denominational doctrinal beliefs. For each of these themes, Noel helps his readers understand the issue, why it is important, and how Spirit-inspired

innovative thinking and action is needed to tackle existing challenges and help revitalize the Pentecostal church in Canada (and the USA). To this end Noel offers pastorally-sensitive, academically-informed prescriptive wisdom as to the ways Pentecostals might respond in order to stay true to Jesus' call to be salt and light in society.

There is much I appreciated and enjoyed about this book. First, Noel is providing a type of resource that is all too rare, falling somewhere between specialized academic writing and popular-level leadership material. He demonstrates his understanding of both the academic and church worlds by his ability to make difficult philosophical, sociological, and theological concepts clear and understandable for his target audience—trained pastors and leaders. He understands that bridging the realms of the academy and clergy requires sufficient demonstration of why and how the topics under discussion are immediately applicable to leadership (since Pentecostals especially can be pragmatically impatient).

Second, the wide variety of topics covered in this book will provide the church leader with plenty to think and pray about for years to come. Covering this variety is not without its risks. At times some elements of the book felt somewhat disconnected from the overall presentation. For example, the PAONL case study is perhaps a bit overly detailed for the reader outside of this denomination (for the interested reader, survey questions from this denomination's self-analysis are available in the appendices). The chapter (6) on creativity and risk derives its principles by exploring the story of early Pentecostal preacher, Aimee Semple McPherson. Some readers may find that the move to narrative fits awkwardly with the rest of the book, although, as Noel notes, it fits well with the Pentecostal appreciation for testimony. I also had questions concerning whether McPherson, with her over-the-top showmanship, should serve as a model for contemporary Pentecostal risk-taking. Noel, however, is aware of these concerns and still believes McPherson to be a helpful exemplar. In any case, once I completed the entire book, I better appreciated how all the chapters served well to contribute to the whole.

Third, Noel is not content simply to describe, but also prescribe possible fruitful directions for Pentecostals. He is not a disconnected

observer, but unashamedly a passionate Pentecostal who cares about his "tribe." He is using his talents as a gifted academic and communicator to call the Pentecostal church to glean from the best of its roots, while leaving behind what is not helpful or biblical—legalism, isolationism, and attractional evangelistic models—for Spirit-enabled incarnational engagement with contemporary culture. This approach will challenge some, who do not realize (or do not want to) that Western culture has moved well beyond the time of the church having significant social influence with society and state. This post-Christendom reality comes with challenges, to be sure, but for Noel it actually allows the church to return to a posture of reliance on the Spirit, rather than on the power of cultural institutions. He believes that Pentecostals are well-suited for just such a time.

Noel has achieved his goal of providing an intellectually- and spiritually-stimulating, comprehensible resource for Pentecostal pastors and leaders. Leadership teams should consider working through this volume together, and it would also fit well as a text in a course on North American Pentecostalism.

Reviewed by Peter D. Neumann
Academic Dean
Master's College & Seminary, Peterborough, ON

Sam Reimer and Michael Wilkinson, *A Culture of Faith: Evangelical Congregations in Canada* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2015). xii+284 pp. $110.00 hardback; $26.36 paper.

Comparing Canada with the United States, historian Mark Noll notes that a country which once appeared "more Christian than Western Europe, and considerably more Christian than its southern neighbor, now appears in its religious character to resemble Europe much more closely than it does the United States."[5] I had a similar reaction after reading Sam Reimer and Michael Wilkinson's *A Culture of Faith: Evangelical Congregations in Canada*. Like its American cousin, Canadian evangelicalism is undergoing a period of institutional stagnation and arrested growth. Based on the data collected in this excellent study, it is farther down this path than U.S. evangelicalism. While some American churches are growing (including the Assemblies of God), this is not true for the groups profiled in *A Culture of Faith*. As Reimer and Wilkinson note in the conclusion, "there is evidence that evangelical congregations are no longer growing," adding that "many (we think most) evangelical denominations have plateaued in both numbers and in finances" (205).

To be sure, Canadian evangelical churches are more institutionally vital than their liberal Protestant and Catholic counterparts. Reeling from the rapid secularization of Quebec, Canadian Catholicism has experienced a precipitous decline. Weathering the collapse of the Canadian Protestant establishment, the United Church of Canada and the Anglican Church of Canada have witnessed a similar decrease in influence, paralleling the cultural disestablishment of U.S. mainline Protestantism.

By contrast, Canadian evangelicals have not declined in numbers, a fact some attribute to greater fertility and recent immigration. Describing a multicultural Pentecostal congregation in Toronto, the authors note the presence of immigrants from Bermuda, Jamaica, the Philippines, and India. According to Reimer and Wilkinson, "evangelical congregations are becoming increasingly diverse and the majority of new congregations are ethnic" (29).

[5] Mark Noll, "What Happened to Christian Canada?" *Church History* 75(2): 245-273 (2006).

Canadian evangelicals also report a strong sense of mission and purpose, emphasizing the faith development of young people, worship, community service, personal spirituality, and evangelism. Many congregations have embraced a missional focus on reaching a "post-Christian society" (112). In congregations affiliated with the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada, 66 percent listed evangelism as a very high priority, while 46 percent gave similar weight to serving the poor and needy (102).

As in the United States, a "new evangelical social engagement" is leading conservative Protestants to serve the wider society.[6] In the year of the survey, nearly 70 percent of Canadian evangelical congregations sponsored a social justice event for young people (164). Unlike their American counterparts, evangelicals in Canada have largely resisted the temptations of politicized faith. According to Reimer and Wilkinson, sexual issues and politics "are not the focus of evangelical congregations," which prefer to emphasize "worship, religious education, and serving their communities" (90).

Despite these obvious strengths, *A Culture of Faith* should not be renamed *Why Canadian Evangelical Churches are Growing*. To the contrary, Reimer and Wilkinson identify several warning signs for Canadian faith leaders. First, Canadian evangelicals are losing a good share of the younger generation. While performing much better than their liberal Protestant and Catholic counterparts, evangelical churches retain just 63 percent of their children and youth (169-170). According to the authors, the rate of retention is lower than in the United States. Second, donations to Canadian congregations are falling, a development that could lead to a "crisis of religious giving in the future" (189). While evangelical weekly attenders gave more than other Canadians, their average annual donation was less than $700 per year. Less than weekly attenders gave an average of $61 annually (187). Third, Canadian evangelicalism is experiencing a clergy shortage, as fewer young people go into full-time ministry. Commenting on this problem, one denominational leader said that the church "was packaged for a generation passing away" (135). While most clergy are happy with their careers, "young pastors have lower job satisfaction and are more critical of their congregations" (156).

[6] Brian Steensland and Philip Goff, eds., *The New Evangelical Social Engagement* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014)

Despite these challenges, evangelical congregations are doing better than churches in other traditions. Drawing on sociologist Christian Smith's subcultural identity theory[7], Reimer and Wilkinson argue that Canadian evangelicals possess distinctive congregational identities that promote religious vitality. Likening evangelicalism to a language with its own grammar and syntax, they argue that Canadian evangelicals foster a "distinct set of beliefs, values, and/or behaviours that keep people in congregations" (44). Given the strength of evangelical organizational culture and the continuing arrival of evangelical immigrants, Canadian church leaders should not despair. In the words of the authors, "any prediction of inevitable decline is premature" (208).

Reviewed by John Schmalzbauer
Blanche Gorman Strong Chair in Protestant Studies
Missouri State University, Springfield, MO

[7] Christian Smith, *American Evangelicalism: Embattled and Thriving* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998).

Peter Hocken, *Azusa, Rome, and Zion: Pentecostal Faith, Catholic Reform, and Jewish Faith* (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2016). xii + 231 pp. $27.00 paper.

Any seasoned theologian knows well the old query, "What has Athens to do with Jerusalem?" Peter Hocken invites readers to rewrite the question with a twist: "What might Azusa [Pentecostalism] and Rome [Catholicism] have to do with Jerusalem?" In both cases, the question involves geographic and socio-religious transference of an ever-evolving gospel: the first, some two thousand years ago from Jerusalem to Athens, the primary hub of the philosophical world, and the second, a gospel now marked by churches around the world with only minimal connection to its original point of origin. Hocken, a seasoned participant in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR) since 1971 and one of its premier historians, uses the latter "cities" to produce an innovative history and passionate appeal for present-day ecumenism. He compiles this collection of unpublished essays written over a lifetime of dialogue to deliver a reasonably coherent trajectory on the rise of the ecumenical dialogue between Pentecostals and Roman Catholics.

Hocken begins with a short history of ecumenism among Pentecostals and Catholics. Participants at the Azusa Street Mission in Los Angeles believed that *revival* of the church should be felt by all Christians and all people. When these rejected Pentecostals had to form new denominations, they pounced on the opportunity to align with Evangelicals. By the mid-twentieth century, they would wrestle again with the rise of the Charismatic renewal, particularly in the high church traditions. Pentecostals eventually demonstrated early signs of ecclesial maturation by entering into formal ecumenical dialogue through the academy. When Hocken turns to the emergence of Catholic ecumenism, he charts the shift from the pre-Vatican II Catholic belief of *vestigiae ecclesiae* to present-day attentiveness concerning the Holy Spirit's work in free churches. Catholic exclusivism, once affirmed as "no salvation outside the church," gives way to affirmation of the Spirit at work outside of the Roman communion, not only among individuals, but church communities, which may in fact reinvigorate forgotten or neglected elements in Catholicism. With this move in mind, John Paul II offers a fitting

description of ecumenism's essence: "Dialogue is not simply an exchange of ideas… [but] an 'exchange of gifts'" (29). Any Christian tradition that engages in such conversation must realize that the other possesses gifts and strengths in certain areas (120).

Hocken suggests that one such gift exchange should include the low ecclesiology of Pentecostals that privileges inner transformation and the Spirit's direct action on individuals versus the extraordinary commitment to ecclesiology of the historic churches, specifically, the CCR's emphasis upon Spirit baptism as a gift for the church, a "spiritual renewal" for blessing the Church and the world. For Hocken, the CCR's commitment to a robust ecclesiology and Pentecostal celebration of personal experience both represent gifts to share and gaps to fill within these respective traditions.

After establishing the pneumatological and ecclesial contributions that ought to be shared between "Azusa" and "Rome," Hocken turns to "Zion" for a model of rapprochement and visible unity. Hocken reflects upon his twenty years of experience among Messianic Jews, who often exhibit the Pentecostal/Charismatic impulse of upstart churches, even as they claim to have resurrected a Jewish expression of the church *catholic* that existed in the first centuries of the Christian era. For Hocken, Messianic Jews exemplify a double belonging; they offer the promise of new life with an ancient heritage and a revivalist spirituality with a compulsion to live out God's promises to Abraham's descendants (96). Furthermore, Messianic Jews embody the convergence of early Pentecostal self-understanding as a Latter Rain restorationist movement and the Catholic understanding of apostolic continuity, an uninterrupted church for all epochs. Hocken envisions a reversal of Luke's programmatic prophecy of a gospel sent out from Jerusalem to the ends of the earth (Acts 1:8). The current path, for Hocken, requires a reversal of history by passing through Rome to a new Jerusalem that descends from heaven and fulfills "the glory and the honor of the nations" (Rev. 21:26).

According to Hocken, the journey home requires passionate commitment to Jesus' ecumenical and catholic prayer that "all may be one" (John 17:21). Free churches must have the freedom to experiment apart from traditional structures, but they must also remain

cognizant of their upstart churches as "ecclesial laboratories" not immune to the afflictions of the older denominations and open to learn from the triumphs and trials of a battle-tested church. Here again, Hocken argues that the church past and present experiences the same ebb and flow, the same continuity and discontinuity as Israel.

Finally, Hocken explores the future impact of Pope Francis. Hocken longs for a fresh "baptized in the Spirit ecumenism" as a possible answer to Francis' concern over "spiritual worldliness" and chronic injustice (174). If the charismatic Francis continues to move the CCR toward center stage in the Catholic Church, Hocken believes that ecumenism should produce a prophetic/counter-cultural vision – a Spirit-inspired justice – for the mission of the *catholic* church to the world. As the first Jewish followers of Jesus negotiated their Judeo-Christian (Jew-Gentile) identity, so also contemporary communities of faith must learn from their Jewish roots and navigate their shared identity and common mission. In a world marred by increasing violence and suffering, Catholics and Pentecostals/Charismatics, the two largest bodies in twenty-first century Christianity, would do well to heed Hocken's message.

Martin Mittelstadt
Evangel University